Education of Syrian Refugee Children in Turkey: Reflections From the Application

Davut Gürelⁱ
Bartın University

Yasemin Büyükşahin ii Bartın University

Abstract

The goal of this research is to take a close look at the issue of immigration and education; views of 19 Turkish teachers who give education to Syrian refugee children in Turkey are analyzed for this purpose. It is attempted to determine the current problems in refugee education in Turkey and present solution suggestions. It is determined that the Turkish teachers didn't receive any kind of proper training during university education and they received a two-week training before starting the education process. On the other hand, it is observed that gender is a significant determiner in the relations between Turkish and Syrian teachers in the education environment. According to the data, most of the students have violent behavioral disorders (ex. Bullying) and psychological problems; it is determined that it is highly important to support the emotional needs of students, especially the ones who witnessed violence acts back in Syria.

Keywords: Education, Syrian Refugees, Turkey

DOI: 10.29329/ijpe.2020.277.26

Correspondence: gureldavut@gmail.com

ⁱ Davut Gürel, Assist. Prof. Dr., Faculty of Education, Bartın University, ORCID: 0000-0003-2309-9202

ⁱⁱ **Yasemin Büyükşahin,** Assist. Prof. Dr., Faculty of Education, Bartın University, ORCID: 0000-0002-5771-2063

INTRODUCTION

It can be said that wars have always been one of the most important determinants of human life throughout the history of mankind. Outcomes of wars, on the other hand, have not only affected the nations/communities that physically participated in them, but also shaped the history of other communities. People who have to migrate from their country because of the war may take the refugee in any country that they can reach. The first societies who had to take shelter in foreign countries preferred places with religious or social similarities; people used to prefer living with people who have common beliefs or live under similar social norms. As kingdoms gained power in time, the shape of migrations changed and countries were responsible for accepting asylum. Greatest migrations in the history of mankind started when the customs and beliefs of minorities were threatened (Altınışık and Yıldırım, 2002). National and international legal systems were shaped and developed in time along with the development of countries; a variety of issues such as the concept of immigrants, refugee admissions, the legal status of refugees are today included in legal systems (Odman, 1995).

The concept of the refugee is expressed in the first article of the 1951 Geneva Refugee Convention as such:

.... owing to well-founded fear of being persecuted for reasons of race, religion, nationality, membership of a particular social group or political opinion, is outside the country of his nationality and is unable or, owing to such fear, is unwilling to avail himself of the protection of that country; or who, not having a nationality and being outside the country of his former habitual residence as a result of such events, is unable or, owing to such fear, is unwilling to return to it.

This definition gives a general idea about the reasons that cause people to leave their homeland and start living somewhere else. In addition to the reasons presented above, it can be said that wars, ethnic conflicts, political disorders, civil class conflicts, religious conflicts, repressive authoritarian regimes, revolutionary regimes, terror, natural disasters and environmental problems are the basic reasons of forced migration (Philo, Briant, and Donald, 2013; Türkoğlu, 2011; Weiner, 1996). The basic condition to define an individual as a refugee is that he/she is afraid of the tyranny for good reasons. The tyranny is the combination of acts that involve torture and cruelty and cause big pain; itis a reflection of the violation of basic human rights and it should be prevented. Tyrannical acts can be resulted from the race, nationality, religion, being a part of a social group, political thought or it can be simply because of the fact that a human being is outside his/her homeland (The 1951 Refugee Convention). Any kind of threat to the right to live, violation of freedom, economic and social rights that make life unbearable can be called tyranny (Altınışık and Yıldırım, 2002). It can be said that one of the most important current problems of humanity is the state created by the refugee who had to leave their homeland with the hope of finding better, more peaceful or basically livable places to live; the economic, social, political and cultural impacts of this state should be carefully analyzed to make the world more peaceful.

One of the most important features of forced migration is the fact that it is not a simple geographic movement that occurs on a horizontal angle; it rather creates results that are important for all of the dimensions of a social structure. Interaction between the immigrants and the locals may cause social problems, conflicts, and assimilation if necessary precautions aren't taken. On the other hand, if the process is well-organized, it may become the source of a cultural richness (Tümtaş and Ergun, 2016). Refugees may accelerate economic and socio-cultural changes or may cause different and unpredictable problems that complicate the process of adjustment (Boyraz et al., 2018).

There have always been violence, wars, internal conflicts in the Middle East; the history of the region is full of people with sad stories. There are some serious current problems in the region. The important recent conflicts started in 2011 when a young individual set himself on fire because of economic reasons in Tunisia; the incident caused significant unexpected problems around a variety of Arab countries including North Africa and the Middle East. The series of incidents is called "Arab Spring" (Fargues and Fandrich, 2012). Syria is one of the last countries affected by this wave; the

unrest has led to a civil war (Sokolowski, Banks and Hayes, 2014). Almost 3.6 millions of Syrians have become refugees because of the still ongoing war, and approximately 3.6 millions of them have been currently living in Turkey under protection (https://data2.unhcr.org/en/situations/syria/location/113).

Turkey has been one of the most famous shelters for refugees because of its geographic location and its historical and cultural features throughout history (Tarman and Gürel, 2017). Today, Turkey is taking all of the precautions to meet the necessities of millions of refugees living in camps specifically built for them; sheltering, feeding, health, security and education are the issues that Turkey gives the effort to maximize. Through this process, it is aimed to ensure the adaptation of refugees to the new society they now have to live with and to become a part of social life. In this process named social adaptation or integration (Bal, 1997), it is necessary to prevent the oppression of the weak by the powerful, to ensure equality of opportunity, support social contribution primarily in the basic areas of social life (Bade, 2009). Besides, refugees should be willing to participate in social activities and adapt to the social rules and customs in the new country (Güner, 2007). Educational institutes are the most powerful instruments that can ease this adaptation. Through the well-planned educations, local societies gain awareness about refugees while refugees can easily adapt to the new society that they meet.

According to the last statistical data in 2018, 1.138.192 of 3.618.624 Syrians living in Turkey are between the ages 5 and 18 (Directorate General of Migration Management, 2018). It is recorded that approximately 400.000 Syrian refugee children who are at the age of education aren't registered to any kind of educational institution (Tüzün, 2017). According to the current data of the Ministry of National Education, there are 532.469 Syrian children in Turkish schools; enrolment rate is 54.55%. Almost half of the students that receive an education are in temporary education centers (Educator Trade Union, 2017). Temporary education centers inside and outside the camps are designed for refugees by Disaster and Emergency Management in 25 different cities. The goal of these institutions serving under the management of City and District National Education Ministry is to enable refugee students that had to immigrate to our country complete their education, to prevent any loss of years in education in case they want to continue their education. On the other hand, it is aimed at organizing and following refugee education in educational institutions connected to the Ministry of National Education (MEB, 2014).

The goal of this study is to obtain and analyze the views of Turkish teachers in the Temporary Education Centers about the problems they face and to make some suggestions to overcome them.

METHODOLOGY

Model of the Research

The goal of this research is to obtain views of Turkish teachers working in the Temporary Education Centers about the education process, - and to analyze the problems they face in the educational process because of the Syrian refugee children. Because of the complicated nature of the issue to be analyzed, case study design, one of the qualitative method designs, is used in the research. Case studies require collecting data with more than one method to best describe a case (Creswell, 2013, p. 14). The basic goal of this design is to understand the process by giving answers to the questions of what, how and why (Gürbüz and Şahin, 2014, p. 108). The case study design is preferred in this study to obtain the views of teachers in the research group about the educational process, to discover their awareness, to understand and define the factors about this awareness and to explain and evaluate the case.

Semi-structured interview technique, which is one of the most preferred and used techniques in qualitative studies, is used in this study and the data are obtained accordingly (Yıldırım and Şimşek, 2013, p. 46).

Study Group

Study group of this research consists of a total of 19 teachers working in temporal Education Centers in İstanbul, Adana, Konya, Ankara, and Bursa. These centers are primary and secondary education centers which run by either non-governmental actors or Syrian refugees outside the camps, or run directly by public authorities or international organizations within the camps under the supervision of the Turkish Ministry of Education. They also have Turkish language teachers (Refugee Rights Turkey, n.d., p. 4).

All participants in the study group work as primary school teachers. Criterion sampling, one of the purposeful sampling methods, is used in this study while determining the teachers to be interviewed. In this sampling method, a researcher organizes the criteria he/she determined before and studies on all cases on the basis of them (Yıldırım and Şimşek, 2013, p. 140). The criterion used in this research in order to determine the teachers in this research is working in Temporary Education Centers. Demographic information of the study group is presented in Table 1.

Table 1. Data about the gender, the existence of Syrian teachers and number of children obtaining an education

Gender	n	The number of children receiving an education	n	Syrian Teachers	n
Female	9	1-100	18	Yes	18
Male	10	100 and over	1	No	1
Total	19	Total	19	Total	19

According to Table 1, 9 of the teachers in the study group are female, 10 are male. 18 of these teachers give education to 1-100 Syrian students while 1 teacher give education to more than 100 Syrian students. According to the Table, there is a Syrian teacher working in the schools of 18 teachers while there is no Syrian teacher in the school of 1 teacher in the study group.

Data Collection Tools and Collecting Data

Data of the research are collected with the semi-structured interview forms. A semi-structured interview form was formed by the researchers by taking into consideration the research questions. In order to provide content validity, the authors reviewed the related literature and took two field experts' opinions. Pilot application of the form was completed with two teacher candidates for tested the clarity of the questions, necessary corrections were made, and the five-question interview form was finalized. Questions in the interview form are presented below:

- 1-What does the concept of refugee mean to you?
- a. Who do you call refugee? Explain.
- 2-Did you receive education about refugee children during college or after graduating from college? Explain.
 - a. How do you see yourself in the education of refugee children?
- 3-What kind of communication do you have with Syrian teachers in Temporary Education Centers?
- a. Do you experience problems in communicating with these teachers? If yes, what are these problems? Explain.
 - 4-What do you think about the psychological state of refugee students? Explain.

5-Do you experience problems in Temporary Education Centers during the educational process? If you do, what are they? Explain.

Data Analysis

Content analysis, one of the qualitative analysis methods, is used for analyzing the data obtained in the scope of the research. Content analysis is used for any qualitative data reduction and sense-making effort that takes a volume of qualitative material and attempts to identify core consistencies and meanings (Patton, 2014). The data that are analyzed with the content analysis method are firstly transcribed then classified according to concepts and themes.

Data obtained from interviews are analyzed by a series of validity control starting from the step of analysis until the final step. Firstly, a different researcher is consulted for ensuring and increasing the validity of codification made by the researcher. Consistency among the coders in terms of codification is observed and analyzed (Miles and Huberman, 2015). Obtained codes and themes are interpreted on the basis of the statements of participators. Different resources in the related literature are analyzed for ensuring the consistency of created themes. An external scholar was consulted for controlling the entire study; after necessary consultations with the external scholar, the obtained findings were evaluated together (Creswell, 2013). In addition, some codes were not suitable for the study or were weak, in such cases the code needs to be removed (Miles and Huberman, 2015). In this research, differences which emerged from the coders and the subject was solved out till an agreement.

Findings obtained at the end of the data analysis process are interpreted in figures and frequencies in the section of findings. Each participator is given a code to keep the identities anonymous. Firstly, gender and then the line of the participator is taken into consideration while creating codes. K1, K2... (K is for Kadın, the Turkish word for Female) and E1, E2... (E is for Erkek, the Turkish word for Male). The number of interviewed teachers are determined according to the sufficiency of the data (Creswell, 2013).

FINDINGS

In this section, findings reached in the scope of research questions are analyzed in the same order as the research questions; findings are presented with themes, sub-themes, examples about sub-themes and quotations from the participator teachers in the frame of sub-problems. Frequencies and percentages of these themes are also evaluated and presented.

Findings and Interpretation of the First Research Question

The findings of "What does the concept of refugee mean to you?" and "Who do you call refugee?" research questions are presented under this title. Themes, sub-themes, examples about them and quotations of teachers are presented in Table 2.

Table 2. Themes, examples, and quotations from participator teachers about the concept of refugee

Themes	Sub-themes	Example statements about sub-themes	Quotations from participator teacher views
	Urgency	A person who had to immigrate, a person who escaped war	I think that refugees are people who had to leave their homeland and sought shelter in other counties. (K2) Refugees are a group of people who had to immigrate.
Concepts in the definition	Difficulty of Conditions	People living under harsh conditions, who cannot afford basic necessities	(E1) I know that they struggle for life under extremely difficult conditions. (E5) I know that they came to our country as there is war in their homeland; I know that their basic needs such as shelter and health are supported in our country. (K8)
Definitions before meeting	Lack of Information	I didn't know	I honestly had no information before. I just had information with the education we received. (E2)

Not being aware	Incomplete awareness through media	I didn't know, I acquired information mostly during education. (K4) I had limited knowledge, I only knew what I saw in social
Prejudices	People who leave their country	media. (E8) I had information about refugees on the basis of the news in the media. I didn't have much information. (K5) I didn't have detailed information. I used to –maybe- misjudging them as I believed that they didn't defend their country and preferred to run away. (K7)

Teachers participated in the research attempted to make a definition of the concept of "refugee" on the basis of their ideas before actually meeting these individuals. They emphasized that they had insufficient information, they had low awareness, about the issue and they sometimes were prejudiced. In this context, the participator teachers stated that they obtained information about refugees only through media channels, which led them, think that refugees are people who left their countries and didn't defend it against enemies.

All of the participators mentioned that working with refugees definitely changed their viewpoints about the issue. Working with them affected their definitions of the concept and they could empathize with refugees as a result of actually working with them. Teachers defined the concept of refugee on the basis of the key concepts of urgency and living under harsh conditions. A person who had to immigrate, a person who lives under harsh conditions are the definitions of immigrant according to teachers. Frequencies and percentages of themes and sub-themes on the basis of teacher definitions about the concept are presented in Table 3.

Table 3. Frequency and Percentages about the themes presented on the basis of viewpoints of participators about the concept of refugee

Themes	Sub-themes	f	%
	Urgency	6	37.5
Concepts used in the definitions	Harsh Conditions	3	18.75
	Lack of Information	8	50
Definitions before meeting refugees	Unawareness	5	31.25
	Prejudices	3	18.75

All of the participators had a critical approach towards their conceptualizations before actually meeting refugees. Half of the participators criticized lack of information while most of them stated that they weren't really aware of the situation of refugees before they met them. Some of the participators made some self-criticisms and mentioned that they had prejudices about refugees. It can be said that negative news about refugees in written and visual media increased the prejudices of participator teachers in the research group.

Findings and Interpretation of the Second Research Question

This part is based on the answers of teachers to the second set of questions in the research process. "Did you receive education about refugee children during college or after graduating from college? And "How do you see yourself in terms of the education of refugee children?" are the questions evaluated in this part. The basic reason why these questions are asked is that there is a belief that the educations of teachers during university or after graduation about refugees affect their awareness about refugees. Findings obtained from the answers of teachers to research questions are presented in Table 4.

Table 4. Educational background of participator teachers, themes, example statements and quotations about refugee education

Themes	Sub-themes	Example statements about sub-themes	Quotations from participator teacher views
	University Education	Classroom teaching graduate	I didn't receive any education about
Educational Background	Not receiving education about the education of foreigners	Not receiving education about the issue, Not receiving education about the education of refugees	foreigners. (E1) I graduated from the classroom teaching department, I didn't receive any education about foreigners. (E2) No, I didn't take any class about the education of foreign groups throughout my education life. (K7)
	Taking Course/ Certificate	Taking 90 hours course	We attended a two-week seminar when we were first assigned this duty. We received a certificate (90 hours-training) about teaching
	Peer Learning	Consulting other teachers	Turkish as a foreign language. We stay in touch with our friends in other schools and cities in order to be able to keep up with the
Sufficiency of refugees in terms of education	Individual Research	Researching from the internet, reading an article, trying to learn their language, researching their culture	developments in foreign education. We try to support each other. In the end, there aren't many people who can support us; this is why we try to help one another. We take support from experienced teachers who are working with refugee students. (E7) I received a 90-hour education in the scope of Lifelong Learning Project Management. I put myself in their shoes. I am trying to help them think about all of the difficulties they may come across (K7)

All of the teachers participated in the research are graduated from the classroom education department of a university. They stated that they had no training about the education of refugees or other disadvantageous groups during university. They only had 90-hour training about refugee education after graduating from university. Participators mentioned that they obtained necessary information from their peers or through internet research. Frequencies and percentages of teacher views about educational background and sufficiency are presented in Table 5.

Table 5. Frequencies and percentages about the educational background of participators and their views about sufficiency in the education of foreigners

Themes	Sub-themes	f	%
	Classroom education university program	19	100
Educational Background	Not receiving education about the education of foreigners	19	100
	Taking course/ certificate	19	100
Sufficiency of refugees in terms of	Peer learning	2	12.5
education	Research	11	68.75

Participators graduated from the classroom education department, mentioned that they received no sufficient training about the education of foreigners. All of the participators who give education o refugees emphasized that they started refugee education through the short course they took. Most of the teachers said that they have been giving effort to continue their duty more productively by "making researches on the internet, reading articles, trying to learn their language, making a research about their culture". It is observed that some of the teachers improved their knowledge by taking information from their colleagues and manage the educational process on the basis of this information.

It is determined that participator teachers had no education or course about the education of foreigners of disadvantageous groups during their university education and their knowledge is based on only one course for 90 hours. Based on these data, it can be said that education given by these

teachers won't be probably of high quality and their lack of information will have a negative impact on their training.

Findings and Interpretations of the Third Research Question

In this section views of participator teachers about their communication with refugee teachers with whom they work together are analyzed. Some specific questions were asked to participator teachers to determine their views about this communication: "What kind of a relationship do you have with Syrian teachers in Temporary Education Centers?" "Do you experience problems in establishing communication?" "If yes, what are these problems?" Themes, examples, and quotations from the answers of Turkish teachers are presented below in Table 6.

Table 6. Themes, examples, and quotations about views of participator teachers about their communication with refugee teachers

Themes	Sub-themes	Sample statements about sub-themes	Quotations from participator teacher views
Positive	The effort to learn a language	Syrian teachers that learn Turkish, Turkish teachers that learn Arabic, students as translators, use of body language	We help each other, we understand each other through sign language; we don't understand each other sometimes. We use children as translators. (K3) I can communicate with the ones who know Turkish. Translators are used for understanding the ones who
Communication	Cooperation	Good communication, helping each other, cooperation	don't know Turkish. (K8) I speak Turkish. I try to teach Turkish to Syrian teachers. I use Arabic translation websites to talk to the ones who don't know Turkish at all. (E2) We have quite good communication with foreign teachers. We didn't have any problem except for the language. (E4)
	Not knowing language	Not knowing Turkish, Knowing only Arabic	Foreign female teachers don't want to talk to male teachers. We don't get much help with children because of
Non- communication	Not being social	Being antisocial and unwillingness	that. As foreign colleagues are distant, we had problems with exchanging information about children. These kinds of problems usually occurred in our communications with foreign female teachers. (E7)
	Because of culture	Understanding of strict discipline in raising children, different cultural features	I work in a temporary education center. There are many Syrian teachers working here. We communicate when it is necessary. Most of them don't know Turkish. Most of the Syrian teachers have negative attitudes towards us. This
	Because of the education system	Traditional teaching, effort to establish dominance	is reflected in our relations with students. Especially female teachers are very distant. They don't even greet us. I don't want children to speak Arabic in class.
Differences	Because of belief	Religions obstacles in Male-Female communication	Students said that Syrian teachers forbid them from speaking Turkish in class. Syrian administrators in temporary education centers behave as if they are our superiors. They want to establish dominance over us. (K5) Communication is limited as they don't know Turkish. One cannot talk to them easily as male and female communication is haram (forbidden by Islam). There are problems as cultures are different. Beating students is normal for them, teachers are tougher and refugee children are used to be beaten. (E8)

Teachers explained their communications with refugee teachers as "positive communication", "non-communication" and "differences". The effort to learn the language and helping each other was the main issue mentioned by the participant teachers in terms of positive communication. The theme of learning language was explained through the sub-themes of "Syrian teachers who learn Turkish, Turkish teachers who learn Arabic, students as translators and the use of body language".

Problems in the theme of non-communication were explained on the basis of "not-knowing language, not being social". Besides explaining problems resulting from positive communication and non-communication, participant teachers mentioned differences between two teacher groups. They

emphasized that differences negatively affected their communication; differences in terms of "culture, education system and belief" are the main issues expressed by teachers. It was emphasized that Syrian families usually raise their children on the basis of a strict, disciplined understanding while Turkish families prefer more flexible methods in raising children. This difference has resulted from the difference in cultural codes of two societies and it is reflected in education methods at schools. It was mentioned that Syrians prefer the teacher-centered and traditional approach in education and this caused a variety of problems in temporary education centers in which Syrians work as managers. Turkish teachers mentioned that they are under pressure and Syrians attempt to marginalize them in these education centers as their understanding in teaching is different. On the other hand, the attempts of Turkish teachers for finding a solution to problems are usually unsuccessful as Syrian teachers don't want to communicate with Turkish teachers. Frequencies and percentages of these themes are presented in Table 7.

Table 7. Frequencies and percentages of themes about participator teachers' views in terms of their communication with refugee teachers

Themes	Sub-themes	f	%
D. I.I. G	The effort to learn a language	5	31.25
Positive Communication	Cooperation	5	31.25
	Not knowing language	4	25
Non-communication	Not being social	3	18.75
	Because of culture	4	25
Differences	Because of the education system	2	12.5
	Because of belief (religion)	3	18.75

It was observed that male and female participant teachers had different viewpoints about the relations they have with refugee teachers that they work together. Although researchers didn't intend to make an interpretation about gender, the specific findings we determined necessitated interpretation. It was observed that most of the teachers who mentioned positive communication were female. Male teachers, on the other hand, frequently mentioned problems in communication. The thought that male-female communication is haram (forbidden in Islam) is common among Syrian teachers and this belief is put into practice mostly by female teachers. This situation has a negative impact on creating a positive school environment in schools and on creating reliable, positive relations among teachers. Teachers in the research group stated that Syrian female teachers generally tend to stay away from Turkish male teachers who try to communicate with them; Syrian male teachers on the other hand generally find male teachers' effort to communicate strange. Under the light of these findings, it is believed that the belief structure of Syrian teachers may negatively affect success in education and process of social integration; this is why the secular education system should be especially prioritized in temporary education centers.

It is determined that teachers in the research group have positive relations with refugee children in temporary education centers. Participant teachers believe that their students see them as "elder sister-brother", "guide", "mother-father" and "friend". All of the participants expressed similar views about this; they emphasized that they have a special connection with students, and they love them.

Findings and Interpretations of the Fourth Research Question

"What do you think about the psychological state of refugee children that you give education?" Teachers in the research group are required to answer this question. Teachers mentioned "psychological features" and "factors that affect these psychological features" while explaining psychological states of their refugee students. Themes, sample statements and references from interviews on the basis of the obtained data are presented in Table 8.

Table 8. Themes, sample statements and references from interviews on the basis of the data obtained from participant teachers about the psychological state of refugee children

Themes	Sub-themes	Sample statements about sub-themes	Quotations from participator teacher views
	Prone to violence	Nervousness, propensity for violence, propensity for militarism, fear, insecurity, aggressiveness	There is too much violence and fear as children came from the environment of war. (E2) They fight all the time as they are prone to violence. They physically harm each other. They believe that they will be beaten when they do something wrong; they think that the biggest punishment is physical violence. They turn whatever
Psychological features	Antisocial behavior	Introversion, non- communication, not being understood.	they find into guns; pencil case, school bag, and pencils They believe that the biggest power is guns. (K2) We witness psychological states such as introversion, insecurity or being highly aggressive. (E5) Some students are highly aggressive. They fight with each other all the time. They give physical damage to one another. They think that there is no problem in doing so. Some of them even enjoy violence. (K5)
	Emotional necessities	Love	They really need love and being loved, refugee students need to feel valuable. (E7)
Factors that affect psychological	Physical necessities	Shelter, clothing, food, cleaning supplies, stationery items	They have many social necessities. Games, cinema, theatre, museums, they don't know what these are. They cannot express their feelings or thoughts while drawing pictures.
features	Social necessities	Safety, belonging, be respected	Drawing a picture means drawing what is drawn on the board on the paper. (K5) They need clothing, a more livable house, food, and security. (K7)

Participant teachers mentioned that the refugee students are "prone to violence" and "antisocial". They used the concepts of "Nervousness, propensity for violence, propensity for militarism, fear, insecurity, aggressiveness" while explaining the violent states of students. Antisocial behaviors of students were explained through the concepts of "introversion, non-communication, not being understood".

Participant teachers said that there are some facts that affect the psychological state of refugee students. "Emotional necessities, "physical necessities" and "social necessities" are significant points according to the teachers. According to them, "love" is the biggest need for these students. "Shelter, clothing, food, cleaning supplies, and stationery items" are some of the physical necessities of students according to teachers. "Safety, sense of belonging and being respected" are the social necessities of students according to participant teachers. Frequencies and percentages of these themes are presented in Table 9.

Table 9. Frequencies and percentages of themes about refugee students' psychological states according to participant teachers

Themes	Sub-themes	f	%
Dayah alasiaal faatuwaa	Prone to violence	19	100
Psychological features	Antisocial	2	12,5
Footone that offert manch alocical	Emotional necessities	19	100
Factors that affect psychological features	Physical necessities	5	31,25
leatures	Social necessities	11	68,75

All of the participant teachers emphasized that students are prone to violence. Some teachers, on the other hand, mentioned that students are antisocial. Teachers said that students need "love" and it is the most significant instrument that can basically support students. The necessity to feel respected and the need to feel safe are the most important factors behind the problems of students according to participants. Besides these necessities, teachers mentioned that it is important to have shelter, proper clothes, food, cleaning supplies, and stationery items.

Findings and Interpretation of the Fifth Research Question

In this section, it is attempted to determine the problems encountered by participant teachers during education. "What kind of problems do you encounter during the educational process in the temporary education centers that you work?" Teachers were required to answer these questions during interviews. Problems mentioned by participants were classified according to the resource of the problem. "Psychological", "Educational", "Physical environment", "Communicational" and "Management" problems are presented under the section of themes. Sub-themes, sample statements, and references from participant interviews are presented in Table 10.

Table 10. Themes, sample statements and references from interviews on the basis of the data obtained from participant teachers about problems they encounter in refugee education

Themes	Sub-themes	Sample statements about sub-themes	Quotations from participator teacher views	
Psychological	Psychological problems	Children with psychological problems, behavioral disorders	The way that children behave to one another is quite problematic, they fight all the time. This is because of psychological reasons. (E4)	
	Curriculum	Lack of curriculum	Children who used to receive essentialist	
	Educational philosophy	Essentialism, Turkish education philosophy	education back in Syria have difficulty in adapting to the educational environment in Turkey. They are used to violence; they don't	
Educational	Application	Different practices of Syrian and Turkish teachers	listen when you are polite. (E8) I am polite and tolerant. They are not used to that. This is why I don't think that they respectful towards me. (K2)	
	Environment	Lesson in a mosque, crowded classrooms, disorder	- Crowded classrooms, there is no program, we	
Physical environment	Material	Lack of Turkish teaching materials in foreign teachers, lack of resources Lack of materials that are to be used for teaching Turkish to foreigners, Lack of resources	give classrooms, there is no program, we give classes in mosques, conditions are deplorable. (E1) As teaching Turkish to foreigners is a new field, there aren't resources in the market; we are trying to find resources. (E8)	
Communication	Language	Refugee teachers and students who don't know Turkish Turkish students who don't know Arabic	Students have conflicts with one another as there are Syrian teachers. They confuse Turkish and Arabic. As there are Arab teachers (Syrian), they can establish more authority in class. Children don't find the opportunity to learn Turkish as Arabic is used by their family members and Syrian teachers. The education system, Syrian teachers and Arabic classes in temporary education centers cause a variety of problems in teaching Turkish to refugee students. (K5)	
	Classroom management problems	Not understanding the rules, not obeying the rules, different classroom management systems	In my opinion, they don't understand some of the things we say and it causes miscommunication; different problems occur in school management because of that. There are many students who	
Management	Problems resulting from organization classes		don't want to learn Turkish; they come to school for fun and cause problems in classes. (E8) Firstly there are too many students in classes. Students at different ages receive education in the same class. Turkish levels of students are different. (K5)	

Participant teachers mentioned that they face a variety of problems during education. Problems expressed by the teachers are grouped under the themes of "psychological", "educational", "physical environment", "communication" and "management". Teachers in the research group said that there are problems because of the psychological states of refugee teachers and students. This issue was also presented and the reasons for it were explained in the research problems analyzed above. It is observed that refugee students are prone to violence, they usually fight with each other and cause

problems; these facts were reemphasized by the participant teachers in this section of the research interview.

Teachers emphasized that there is not a specific curriculum for refugee education; it is a significant problem in the category of problems resulting from education. It is understood that participant teachers have difficulty in making plans and arrangements in curriculums according to refugee students who have both psychological and educational difficulties. In addition to these, according to the participants, there are important differences between Turkish and educational philosophies, which is another reason why refugee education is difficult. Refugee students mentioned that the approach of Syrian and Turkish teachers towards facts and issues are different, and it is difficult for them to perceive this situation.

It is observed that problems in the category of physical conditions result from the improper environment and lack of materials. Participant teachers said that temporary education centers aren't proper for education and classrooms are very crowded. On the other hand, they mentioned that they don't have sufficient materials for teaching Turkish to foreigners and preparing materials for this purpose take a lot of time and effort.

Communication problems mentioned by participants are based on the difference in language. As refugee students use Arabic with their family members and there are Syrian teachers in classes, they don't feel obliged to learn Turkish.

Another problem category commonly mentioned by the teachers in the research group is management problems. Problems in this category are divided into two themes: "classroom management" and "school management". Not obeying the rules, not understanding the rules, different management methods are the sub-themes of classroom management section. Differences in age and cognitive level are the sub-themes of the section of difference in educational level.

Another problem group that was commonly stated by teachers in the research group resulted from school management. Classroom management by teacher and school administration are the two sub-themes of this problem group. According to the participant teachers, Problems resulting from classroom management were: 'not understanding the rules and the use of different classroom management systems'. Problems resulting from the organization of classes were based on the fact that students with different ages and cognitive levels receiving education in the same class. Frequencies and percentages of these problems are presented in Table 11.

Table 11. Frequencies and percentages of themes about problems in the process of refugee education mentioned by participant teachers

Themes	Sub-themes	f	%
Psychological	Psychological problems	2	12.5
	Curriculum	2	12.5
Educational	Educational Philosophy	1	6.25
	Practice	4	25
DI	Environment	4	25
Physical environment	Material	2	12.5
Communication	Language	8	50
Managamant	Problems resulting from the organization of classes	19	100
Management	Problems resulting from classroom management	6	37.5

Participant teachers drew attention to the problems of language while describing their problems during the process of education. Another problem group frequently stated by the participants was classroom management. Students who are prone to violence, the tradition of punishment in Syrian culture and children who are used be punished and beaten, inconvenience of educational environments, Syrian teachers who continue to use traditional teaching methods and problems because of different practices of two different teacher groups are the main reasons of problems experienced in managing classes.

Teachers stated that they usually prefer punishing refugee students when they cause a problem in classes. They emphasized that positive practices don't have any effect on these children as they are used to be punished. They mentioned Syrian teachers used to punish students; according to them a certain kind of discipline is necessary for these children who were raised with traditional Syrian methods in Syria. It is said that different practices of Syrian and Turkish teachers for changing student behaviors cause conflicts; refugee students cannot get used to the methods of Turkish students and they become inconsistent.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Individuals make definitions and form concepts on the basis of their very own experiences. When the definitions about "immigration" by participators are analyzed, it can be seen that there are some missing points. As teachers in the research don't have any previous knowledge and experience about the concept, their definitions incomplete. Teachers attempted to explain the concept of immigration by using their knowledge about immigration or living under harsh circumstances because of war. These definitions of teachers are very superficial as they didn't consider political conflicts, terror, natural disasters, ethnic and class conflicts and economic reasons behind the concept (Weiner, 1996; Türkoğlu, 2011). This finding of the research indicating the lack of knowledge about refugees is in line with the findings obtained in some previous researches about the issue (Tarman & Gürel, 2017). Besides that, it is observed that working with the refugees decreased the misconceptions and prejudices of teachers, ensured a more emphatic attitude and changed, corrected their definitions about immigration.

Educators who are to work with refugees or immigrants should have special training; it is crucial to have sufficient knowledge and training to present efficient and proper education to these specific groups (Canales & Harris, 2004). Despite this fact, previous researches and this study indicate that teachers who give education to refugees didn't receive any kind of qualified training and they have to start giving education to their students after a very brief training process. Teachers with insufficient knowledge naturally attempt to increase their knowledge or fill the missing points with personal effort with the support and cooperation of other colleagues and with different resources (İstanbul Bilgi University, 2015). It can be said that basic discipline problems in classes, conflicts or misunderstandings between Turkish and Syrian teachers and miscommunication between teachers and students are some of the problems resulting from the insufficient training of teachers. As teachers feel insufficient in managing classes, education process becomes more problematic. Teachers who receive proper, specifically designed training will surely be more fruitful and establish better communication with refugees. Teachers will have more positive attitudes and qualified education will ensure more efficient learning environments which will naturally affect refugee children's success. According to the related literature, immigrant or refugees should be educated in environments in which they feel valuable, teachers should be knowledgeable and aware of their responsibilities, they should determine the materials they need in education, they should be able to understand the needs of these students and prepare learning environments accordingly (Aydın, Gündoğdu & Akgül, 2019; McBrien, 2005; Durón, 2004).

Turkish students in the research mentioned that they generally have positive communication with Syrian teachers that they work together in temporary education centers; on the other hand, they stated that they occasionally experience some problems because of miscommunication. The most significant reason of miscommunication is the different languages used by these two groups of teachers (Crul et al., 2019; Eren, 2019; Taşkın & Erdemli, 2018; Crul et al., 2017; Emin, 2016; Bircan & Sunata, 2015; İstanbul Bilgi University, 2015; Chase, Knight & Statham, 2008). In addition to this important problem, Syrian teachers abstain from communicating with Turkish teachers basically because of religious orders. At this point, it seems crucial to give support to both Turkish and Syrian teachers not only to ensure cooperation between them but also increase motivation and professional development (Aydın, Gündoğdu & Akgül, 2019; Taşkın & Erdemli, 2018; Aydın & Kaya, 2017; Crul et al., 2017; İstanbul Bilgi University, 2015; UNICEF, 2015).

Deficiency of curriculum is the most important problem in the education of refugees in temporary education centers. Lack of materials and resources for teaching Turkish to foreigners, crowded classrooms, difficulties in managing classes, different practices of Turkish and Syrian teachers, different educational philosophies used by Turkey and Syria, psychological problems of students are the other important problems in the refugee education process. This finding of the research is supported by other similar researches in the related literature (Crul et al., 2019; Aydın, Gündoğdu & Akgül, 2019; Sidery, 2019; Uğurlu, 2018; Crul et al., 2017; Emin, 20016; Hos, 2016; Wu & Aydoğan, 2016; Bircan & Sunata, 2015; UNESCO, 2011). First of all, linguistic, academic, mental, emotional, social and physical necessities of students should be taken into consideration while preparing curriculums (Aydın, Gündoğdu & Akgül, 2019; Alanis, 2004). Some of the most important points in refugee education are supporting their emotional, physical and social needs. The basic way to reach that is to use consistent practices and shape their behaviors and to show them love and affection. Teachers participated in the research emphasized that the biggest and most important instrument that can be used for healing these students is love. Creating a learning environment based on positive relationships will not only help refugees but also increase the motivation of Turkish teachers. Teachers mentioned that students in temporary education centers have a wide range of psychological problems such as being aggressive, being prone to violence, militarist attitudes, offensiveness, insecure attitudes, not being able to establish communication, not obeying rules, the anxiety to be misunderstood. It should be noted that these students came from a dangerous place and they are now living under harsh conditions; they don't have any place to play games or they play in dirty, improper fields and all these states contribute to their psychological problems (Emin, 2016). In addition to these, living conditions in refugee camps (Solls, 2004), noise, stress and pressure resulting from living in a small space together with the other family members, grouping in camps and tension between these groups (Erdoğan, 2014a), indifference of families in terms of education (İstanbul Bilgi University, 2015; Franquiz & Hernandez, 2004) are some other reasons that cause the above mentioned problems. On the other hand, while Syrian boys have to work, gain money and support their family, girls are forced to marry at early ages (Emin, 2016; Wu & Aydoğan, 2016; Deane, 2016; Bircan & Sunata, 2015; Erdoğan, 2014b); these facts cause additional pressure and negatively affect the psychology students.

Students should be supported by teachers for learning through cooperation to overcome the problems in temporary education centers. Refugee children who had to witness war and experienced significant problems could regain their self-esteem and develop their social relations (Alanis, 2004). Environments in which these children don't feel alone and insecure should be established (Duron, 2004). On the other hand, Syrian teachers who witnessed violence and had traumatic experiences should receive specific training prioritizing peace and solution finding (Aydın, Gündoğdu & Akgül, 2019; Crul et al., 2017). Besides all these, steps for organizing and enriching education in temporary education centers should be sustainable. Coordination with authorities is important in the process of determining steps. A holistic viewpoint and standardization of curriculums are important to overcome the problems in refugee education, increase the success of students and ease social integration (Hoş, 2015). The philosophy to be followed at each step in refugee education should be "no children should be left behind in the journey of education".

REFERENCES

- Alanis, I. (2004). Effective Instruction: Integrating Language and Literacy. In C. Salinas & M.E. Franquiz (Eds.), *Scholars in the Field: The Challenges of Migrant Education*, (pp. 311-227) (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED482321)
- Altınısık, C. ve Yıldırım, M. S. (2002). Mülteci Haklarının Korunması, Ankara Barosu Yayınları, s.6.
- Aydın, H., & Kaya, Y. (2017). The educational needs of and barriers faced by Syrian refugee students in Turkey: a qualitative case study. *Intercultural Education*, 28(5), 456–473.)
- Aydın, H., Gündoğdu, M., & Akgül, A. (2019). Integration of Syrian refugees in Turkey: understanding the educators' perception. *Journal of International Migration and Integration*, 1-12

- Bade, K.J. (2009). Integration und Partizipation in Deutschland, *Die Gaste*, 8, July-August 2009. http://www.diegaste.de/gaste/diegaste-sayi807.html. Accessed 01.07.2019.
- Bal, H. (1997). Sosyolojik açıdan Alevi-Sünni farklılaşması ve bütünleşmesi: Isparta'nın Alevi-Sünni ortak yaşayan iki köyü üstüne yapılmış karşılaştırmalı bir araştırma. İstanbul: Ant Yayınları. http://www.worldcat.org/oclc/38159750.
- Bircan, T., & Sunata, U. (2015). Educational Assessment of Syrian Refugees in Turkey. *Migration Letters*, 3(12), 226–237.
- Boyraz, E., Sözüpek, H., Esen, S., & Ay, O. (2018). Vicdan ve Akıl Kıskacında İnsanlık, Komşuluk, Kardeşlik: Suriyeli Sığınmacılara İlişkin Algılara Politika Pazarlaması Perspektifinden Bir Bakış. Eskişehir Osmangazi Üniversitesi İktisadi ve İdari Bilimler Dergisi, 1(13), 87-112.
- Canales, P., & Harris, J. (2004). Migrant Service Coordination: Effective Field-Based Practices. In C. Salinas & M.E. Franquiz (Eds.), *Scholars in the Field: The Challenges of Migrant Education*, (pp. 61-77) (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED482321)
- Chase, E., Knight, A., & Statham, J. (2008). Promoting the emotional wellbeing and mental health of unaccompanied young people seeking asylum in the UK. London: Thomas Coram.
- Creswell, J.W. (2013). *Araştırma deseni: nitel, nicel ve karma yöntem yaklaşımları.* (S.B. Demir, Çev. Ed.), Ankara: Eğiten Kitap.
- Crul, M. R. J., Keskiner, E., Schneider, J., Lelie, F., & Ghaeminia, S. (2017). No lost generation? Education for refugee children: a comparison between Sweden, Germany, The Netherlands and Turkey. In R. Bauböck, & M. Tripkovic (Eds.), *The Integration of Migrants and Refugees:* An EUI Forum On Migration, Citizenship And Demography (pp. 62-80). [1] EUI. https://doi.org/10.2870/30835
- Crul, M., Lelie, F., Biner, Ö., Bunar, N., Keskiner, E., Kokkali, I., Schneider, J., & Maha Shuayb, M. (2019). How the different policies and school systems affect the inclusion of Syrian refugee children in Sweden, Germany, Greece, Lebanon and Turkey. Crul et al. *Comparative Migration Studies*, 7(10), 2–20. https://doi.org/10.1186/s40878-018-0110-6
- Deane, S. (2016). Syria's lost generation: Refugee education provision and societal security in an ongoing conflict emergency. *IDS Bulletin*, 3(47), 35-52. doi: 10.19088/1968-2016.143
- Durón, S. (2004). Identification and Recruitment: Trends and Issues. In C. Salinas & M.E. Franquiz (Eds.), *Scholars in the Field: The Challenges of Migrant Education*, (pp. 31-45) (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED482321)
- Emin, M.B. (2016). Türkiye'deki Suriyeli Çocukların Eğitimi Temel Eğitim Politikaları. SETA (Siyaset, Ekonomi ve Toplum Araştırmaları Vakfı), 153. Retrieved from: http://file.setav.org/Files/Pdf/20160309195808_turkiyedeki-suriyeli-cocuklarin-egitimi-pdf.pdf
- Erdogan, M. M. (2014). Perceptions of Syrians in Turkey. *Insight Turkey*, 4(16), 65-77.
- Erdoğan, M. M. (2014b). Türkiye'deki Suriyeliler: Toplumsal Kabul ve Uyum Araştırması. Ankara: Hacettepe Üniversitesi Göç ve Siyaset Araştırmaları Merkezi-Hugo Yayınları
- Eren, Z. (2019). Yönetici ve öğretmen görüşlerine göre göçmen çocukların eğitim sorunları ve çözüm önerileri. Bolu Abant İzzet Baysal Üniversitesi Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi, 19(1), 213-234.
- Fargues, P., & Fandrich, C. (2012). The European Response to the Syrian Refugee Crisis What Next?. MPC RR 2012/14, Robert Schuman Centre for Advanced Studies, San Domenico di

- Fiesole (FI): European University Institute, 2012. Retrieved from: http://cadmus.eui.eu/handle/1814/24836
- Franquiz, M. E., & Hernandez, C. L. (2004). Casa de la Esperanza: A Case Study of Service Coordinationat Work in Colorado. In C. Salinas & M.E. Franquiz (Eds.), *Scholars in the Field: The Challenges of Migrant Education*, (pp. 77-93) (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED482321)
- Güner, C. (2007). İltica Konusunda Türkiye'nin Yol Haritası: Ulusal Eylem Planı [The Road-Map of Turkey About Refuge: The National Action Plan]. Ankara Üniversitesi Hukuk Fakültesi Dergisi (AÜHFD), 56 (4): 97. http://dergiler.ankara.edu.tr/dergiler/38/264/2373.pdf.
- Gürbüz, S., & Şahin, F. (2014). Sosyal bilimlerde araştırma yöntemleri: felsefe- yöntem-analiz. Ankara: Seçkin Yayıncılık.
- Hoş, R. (2016). Education in Emergencies: Case of a Community School for Syrian Refugees. European Journal of Educational Research, 5(2), 53-60. doi: 10.12973/eu-jer.5.2.53
- İçişleri Bakanlığı Göç İdaresi Genel Müdürlüğü. (2018). Göç İstatistikleri: Geçici Koruma. Haziran 5, 2018 tarihinde http://www.goc.gov.tr/icerik6/gecici-koruma_363_378_4713_icerik adresinden alındı.
- İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi. (2015). Suriyeli Mülteci çocukların Türkiye devlet okullarındaki durumu politika ve uygulama önerileri. İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi Çocuk Çalışmaları Birimi. Retrieved from: cocuk.bilgi.edu.tr/wp-content/.../Suriyeli-Cocuklar-Egitim-Sistemi-Politika-Notu.pdf
- MEB. (2014). Yabancılara Yönelik Eğitim-Öğretim Hizmetleri. Retrieved from: mevzuat.meb.gov.tr/dosyalar/1715.pdf
- Miles, M.B., & Huberman, A.M. (2015). *Nitel veri analizi*. (S. Akbaba Altun ve A. Ersoy, Trans. Ed.). Ankara: Pegem Akademi.
- Odman, M. T. (1995). *Mülteci hukuku*. Cebeci, Ankara: Ankara Üniversitesi, Siyasal Bilgiler Fakültesi, İnsan Hakları Merkezi. http://www.worldcat.org/oclc/38764223.
- Patton, M. Q. (2014). *Nitel araştırma ve değerlendirme yöntemleri* (M. Bütün ve S.B. Demir, Çev. Ed.). Ankara: Pegem.
- Philo, G., Briant, E., & Donald, P. (2013). Bad news for refugees. London: Pluto Press.
- Refugee Rights Turkey. (n.d). The right to education for Syrian refugees and other persons under temporary protection: questions & answers. Retrieved from: https://www.mhd.org.tr/images/yayinlar/MHM-8.pdf
- Sidery, A. (2019). Fostering unaccompanied asylum seeking young people: the views of foster carers on their training and support needs. *Adoption & Fostering*, 43(1), 6-21.
- Sokolowski, J. A., Banks, C. M., & Hayes, R. L. (2014, December). Modeling population displacement in the Syrian city of Aleppo. In *Simulation Conference (WSC)*, 2014 Winter (pp. 252-263). IEEE
- Solls, J. J. (2004). Scholastic Demands on Intrastate and Interstate Migrant Secondary Students. In C. Salinas & M.E. Franquiz (Eds.), *Scholars in the Field: The Challenges of Migrant Education* (pp. 113-119). (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED482321).

- Tarman, B., & Gürel, D. (2017). Awareness of social studies teacher candidates on refugees in Turkey. *The Journal of Social Studies Research*, 41(3), 183-193. doi: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jssr.2016.11.001
- Taşkın, P., & Erdemli, Ö. (2018). Education for Syrian Refugees: Problems Faced by Teachers in Turkey. *Eurasian Journal of Educational Research* 75, 155-178. doi: 10.14689/ejer.2018.75.9
- The Refugee Convention. (1951). Retrieved from: https://www.unhcr.org/4ca34be29.pdf
- Tümtaş, M.S. & Ergun, C. (2016). Göçün Toplumsal ve Mekânsal Yapı Üzerindeki Etkileri, Süleyman Demirel Üniversitesi İktisadi ve İdari Bilimler Fakültesi Dergisi, 4(21), 1347-1359.
- Türkoğlu, O. (2011). Refugees and National/International Security. *Uludağ Journal of Economy and Society*, 2 (30): 101-118.
- Türkoğlu, O. (2011). Refugees and national/international security. Uludağ Journal of Economy and Society, 2(30), 101–118.
- Tüzün, I. (2017). Türkiye'de Mülteci Çocukların Eğitim Hakkını ve Karşılıklı Uyumu Destekleyen Yaklaşımlar, Politikalar ve Uygulamalar. European Liberal Forum 2017. http://panel.stgm.org.tr/vera/app/var/files/t/u/turkiyede-multeci-cocuklarin-egitim-hakkini-destekleyen-yaklasimlar-politikalar-ve-uygulamalar-fnf-turkiye.pdf
- Uğurlu, Z. (2018). Suriyeli Sığınmacı Öğrencilerin Okula Uyum Sorunlarının Çözülmesi ve Desteklenmesinde Öğretmen Etkisi. In Solak, A. (Ed.), *Şiddet ve sosyal travmalar* (pp. 178-243). Ankara: Hegem Yayınları.
- UNESCO (2011). The Hidden Crisis: Armed Conflict and Education, Efa Global Monitoring Report. Retrieved from: http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0019/001907/190743e.pdf
- UNHCR (BMMYK), (1998). Sığınma ve Mülteci Konularındaki Uluslararası Belgeler ve Hukuki Metinler. Ankara: Birleşmiş Milletler Mülteciler Yüksek Komiserliği. http://www.worldcat.org/oclc/51024105
- UNICEF. (2015). Curriculum, accreditation and certification for Syrian children in Syria, Turkey, Lebanon, Jordan, Iraq and Egypt. Retrieved from: https://www.alnap.org/system/files/content/resource/files/main/267-150527-cac-for-syrian-children-report-final.pdf
- Weiner, M. (1993). Security, Stability, And International Migration. Cambridge, Mass: Defense and Arms Control Studies Program, Center for International Studies, Massachusetts Institute of Technology. http://dx.doi.org/10.2307/2539131
- Wu, W., & Aydoğan, A. (2016). A Lost Generation? No Lost Generation Barriers to Education for Urban Syrian Refugees in Turkey. Retrieved from: https://www.academia.edu/35415497/A_Lost_Generation_No_Lost_Generation_Barriers_to _Education_for_Urban_Syrian_Refugees_in_Turkey
- Yıldırım, A. & Şimşek, H. (2013). Sosyal bilimlerde nitel araştırma yöntemleri. (Genişletilmiş 9. Baskı) Ankara: Seçkin Yayıncılık.